

**MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE HELD THURSDAY 7 FEBRUARY 2019
at 7.00 pm**

PRESENT: Councillors Mrs Carlyon, Ellis, Nolan, Mrs Nolan, Smith, Ms Southcombe, Mrs Swain, Vella (Chairman) Webb and Wells.

APOLOGIES: An apology for absence was reported from Councillors Tamblin and Mrs Tudor

Also in attendance: Councillor Roden

Mr Damien Burley, Director, Walker Developments (SW) Ltd.

Mr Stephen Bott, Planning Consultant

311 DISCLOSURES OR DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Minute 287 – Land North of Little Newham Road, Newham

Councillors Ms Southcombe, Mrs Nolan and Nolan declared an interest in the above item on the grounds of knowing the applicant.

Minute 287 – Xenia, Union Street

Councillor Vella declared an interest in the above item as he had professional involvement with the development in the past.

Councillor Wells also declared an interest in the above item as he was a trustee of the land adjoining Williams Court.

312 MINUTES

The Minutes of the meeting held 3 January 2019, having been before Council on 28 January 2018, were signed as a correct record.

313 PLANNING CONSULTATION

(a) Schedule 1

Further to all Councillors of Truro City Council being given the opportunity to submit comments to applications in their Ward (by an agreed deadline), and for Members of the Planning Committee to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the agenda for this meeting, it was proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) that it be unanimously:

RESOLVED that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1, as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning Committee.

(b) Schedule 2

The Committee considered plans submitted in accordance with the planning consultation procedure, details of which are attached (Schedule 2), and, that it be

RESOLVED that Cornwall Council be informed of the following recommendations as voted upon by Truro City Council's Planning Committee: -

**(i) Land North of Little Newham, Newham Road (6)
(PA19/00211)**

Unanimous approval recommended subject to ensuring that CC Highways are satisfied with road safety, and there is a condition applied for a replanting scheme in line with the Tree Officer's comments.

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

As Councillors Ms Southcombe, Mrs Nolan and Nolan declared an interest in the above item they left the room and did not participate in the discussion or vote.

Mr Bott left the meeting upon conclusion of the recommendation.

(ii) Land to the Rear of Maiden Green, Threemilestone (1)
(PA18/11022)

Approval recommended, though Members strongly recommend that the developer considers using the flat roofs of both the petrol filling station and sales building for solar panels to supply charging units for electric cars, and the addition of a condition on the lighting to ensure it does not contribute to light pollution and sky glow or have an adverse impact on wildlife.

Councillor Ms Southcombe wished for her name to be recorded as having voted against the above recommendation.

Proposer: Councillor Webb
Secunder: Councillor Ellis

Councillor Roden left the meeting at 7:42pm.

(iii) 6 Trehaverne Vean (2)
(PA18/10890)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the proposed conversion and extension on the grounds of poor design with inadequate kitchen facilities. Members invited the applicant to come back with a more suitable design.

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(iv) Xenia, Union Street (3)
(PA18/11510)

Approval recommended for the construction of seven dwellings subject to no sustainable complaints from the neighbours, and if possible, that more parking provision can be accommodated.

Proposer: Councillor Ellis
Secunder: Councillor Smith

As Councillor Vella declared an interest in the above application, he left the room and did not participate in the discussion or vote. Councillor Webb (Vice-Chairman) therefore took the Chair during this item.

As Councillor Wells declared an interest in the above recommendation he did not vote on the above item, though he did remain in the room during the discussion.

Upon conclusion of the recommendation, Councillor Vella resumed his position as Chairman.

(v) 21 Green Close (4)
(PA18/11692)

Unanimous approval for the proposed first floor rear extension subject to there being no sustainable objections from the neighbours.

Proposer: Councillor Webb
Secunder: Councillor Ellis

(vi) 14 Daniell Street (5)
(PA18/11956)

Refusal recommended for the installation of the shutters, although Members had no objection to the proposal in principle, they felt the chosen, inappropriate design would significantly alter the appearance of the windows and have an adverse impact on the

listed building. Members invited the applicant to submit a more appropriate design in keeping with the street scene.

Proposer: Councillor Webb
Seconder: Councillor Vella

Councillor Mrs Nolan wished for her name to be recorded as having voted against the above recommendation.

(vii) **Shorton House, 7 Kenwyn Gardens (7)**
(PA19/00326)

Approval recommended for the works to a multi-stemmed Ash tree subject to the planting of a suitable replacement tree.

Proposer: Councillor Webb
Seconder: Councillor Ellis

Councillor Ms Southcombe (Mayor) wished for her name to be recorded as having voted against the above recommendation.

(viii) **13 Harrison Terrace (8)**
(PA19/00354)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the remodelling of an existing extension as Members felt the design was wholly inappropriate in relation to the dwelling, and the materials were also inappropriate. Members welcomed a resubmission with a design more sympathetic to the building with appropriate fenestration. A suggestion was made for a lantern light and small window instead.

Proposer: Councillor Vella

(c) **Planning Decisions**

Members noted the Planning Decision list circulated with the agenda.

314 PLANNING CONSULTATION

Great Western Rail Staff Association and Periphery Land

Members considered a consultation of land and property known as the Cornwall Farmers depot, situated immediately adjacent to and North West of Truro Station. The site is leased to Cornwall Farmers until 2038. Cornwall Farmers have not used the property themselves for many years and over three years ago sublet it for standard warehouse use. The siding serving the property is in disrepair and has not been used for over 12 years. It has been clipped out of use, and network change has been approved, removing it from the Sectional Appendix. The other sidings around the station, the MDU and other station and rail operations are unaffected. Closing date for comments was 27 February 2019.

The Chairman commented that an informal meeting with Network Rail and the Truro Kenwyn Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group had taken place that afternoon, and that notes from that meeting would be considered when formulating a response. The Chairman felt the consensus from the meeting was that the disposal of land had not been considered thoroughly, and that it was the government target of housing that had prompted the suggestion as opposed to a Network Rail target. Though it was important to consider housing where possible, it was also important to weigh up the appropriateness of an area, and it was felt this site had serious problems for housing development.

Members felt that it was unlikely 35% affordable homes on site would be reached, and that there were significant concerns about the access, particularly the steep road off Dobbs Lane, which was likely to become impassable in severe weather conditions. There was also consideration that should this land be disposed of for housing then it was likely the freight land on the other side of the railway would eventually also be designated for the same, and that it was important to note that even if Network Rail had no current plans to use the land for freight, this could change in the future and therefore a hasty decision should not be made. Members considered this was particularly in light of the demand for same day deliveries which put additional pressure on road transportation, which was felt would lead to the need to look for alternative means of transportation to cope.

Other concerns expressed by Members included air quality and issues relating to sewage, as well as the potential loss of an important wildlife corridor.

Following the above discussion, it was proposed by the Chairman and

RESOLVED that the Chairman draft a response to Network Rail and circulate it to the Planning Committee via email for rapid feedback which would then be amalgamated into a final response, by himself and the Vice-Chairman, to be submitted before the deadline of 27 February 2019.

315 LANGARTH STAKEHOLDER GROUP

Further to Minute 299 (28.01.19) of Council, Members discussed Truro City Council representation on the group, of which two places had been allocated. It was commented the first meeting would take place on 18 February 2019.

Councillor Vella (Chairman) informed Members that the Mayor of Truro City Council and the Chairman of the Planning Committee had been formally invited to sit on the group, but that he felt that other Members of the Planning Committee should be able to attend and listen if they wished. It had been further agreed with the Mayor that as her term of office was coming to an end in May, it made more sense for the Deputy Mayor to take her place on the group instead.

Following discussion, it was proposed by the Chairman and unanimously

RESOLVED that the Deputy Mayor of Truro and the Chairman of the Planning Committee, with the respective substitutions of Councillor Mrs Carlyon and the Vice-Chairman of the Planning Committee, sit on the Langarth Stakeholder Group as representatives of Truro City Council.

316 PROPOSAL TO PEDESTRIANISE BOSCAWEN STREET

Further to Minute 307 (28.01.19) of Council, Members discussed the potential pedestrianisation of Boscawen Street, considering a letter received from a member of the public asking for a discussion on this subject to take place (the letter was reported by the Town Clerk at Council).

Councillor Wells commented that the Truro BID consultation (summary circulated to Members prior to this meeting), which had questioned various businesses in Truro as

to whether they wished for pedestrianisation, was limited in scope, and there was no decisive response as some welcomed the idea whereas others did not. Members would need to consider whether a full consultation, as Councillor Wells had been tasked with looking into in January 2018, should now take place.

Members discussed the possibility of pedestrianisation and commented it may be prudent to wait until there was a more definite plan for the Pydar Street development, which had the capacity to change the direction of the City Centre and would potentially also need to be added to the local bus route.

Councillor Webb commented that, speaking as someone who used a wheelchair, it was very difficult and slippery to get in and out of a car parked along Boscawen Street, so he did not feel that disabled parking in this area was a high priority, as long as suitable parking was provided within a short walking distance.

Members also discussed the need to consult with a wider range of people beyond local businesses, because pedestrianisation could have a large impact on various groups of people, such as disabled persons or the elderly. Councillor Mrs Swain spoke briefly about those with hidden disabilities and pointed out that without the River Street and Victoria Square bus stops, there was a long walk between the next two stops (Railway Station to the bus depot/Quay Street stops), and therefore this would also need to be addressed.

In answer to questions from Councillor Mrs Carlyon, Councillor Wells felt any trial would implement pedestrianisation between the hours of 10pm and 4pm, which would also allow for deliveries and drop-offs to shops within the City Centre outside of these core hours, as well as address any concerns relating to personal safety borne through feeling isolated in the City Centre at night should there not be any vehicular movements. In addition, a traffic order would be implemented that would negate the need for additional costings (as would be incurred during event road closures).

Members also discussed the issue with the cobbles on Boscawen Street, that were frequently being repaired due to the weight of busses and coaches driving along them. There was concern that eventually the street would be damaged beyond repair, and that it was important to maintain the heritage of the area, which was currently being promoted by Visit Truro and Visit Cornwall. Councillor Smith commented he thought it would be a good idea to reinstate the previously demolished “middle row” on Boscawen Street, with buildings that looked as they did previously, but housing various cafes or market stalls etc.

Members agreed that this should be discussed in more depth, and it was suggested Councillor Vella (Chairman) join the next meeting of Future Truro (date to be confirmed with the Town Clerk) to raise this idea for discussion.

317 CHAIRMAN'S REPORT

The Chairman felt much had already been covered in the meeting but commented that there had not yet been any word on the appeal for the New Mills Lane site.

The Chairman also reminded Members there was an informal meeting with Zero C, the developers of a proposal at Higher Newham, to be held on Tuesday 12 February 2019 at 6:30pm in Penhaligon House.

318 CORRESPONDENCE

There was no correspondence to report.

The meeting closed at 8:57pm.

CHAIRMAN

Schedule 1

PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 7 February 2019

SCHEDULE 1 – To Receive a Single Recommendation for the Entire Schedule at the Meeting.

If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Thursday 31 January at 5pm for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.

If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Comments from Case Officers	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
PA18/10425 Nanjizal 7 Treseders Gardens Mr Neil Holian	Application for various works on trees	Boscawen	Neil Butler “From a public amenity point of view it looks fine to me as the cuts are on the side of the property. From an arboricultural point of view, I have consulted the tree officer”.	Approval subject to works being carried out strictly in accordance with the requirements of the Forestry Officer and with BS 3998:2010.
PA18/10890 6 Trehaverne Vean Ms A Haynes	Proposed conversion and extension of garage to form one-bedroom self-contained annexe	Trehaverne	Glenn Lowe	Schedule 2
PA18/11956 14 Daniell Street Dr Nicholas Weston Smith	Install shutters to the inside of the front windows: one on the ground floor and two on the first floor. (NB. Listed Building Consent)	Redannick	Janice Taylor	Schedule 2
PA18/11022 Land Rear of Maiden Green, Threemilestone	Development of a petrol filling station (PFS) including a new sales building, underground tanks, pump island/canopy, forecourt, car parking, landscaping, boundary treatments, drainage infrastructure, associated access arrangements (including A390 junction and associated pedestrian access) and associated infrastructure (including an artificial badger sett).	Kenwyn Parish	Matthew Doble	Schedule 2

Schedule 1

<p>PA18/12019 Elm Field Kenwyn Road Mr and Mrs Mitchell</p>	<p>Use of outbuilding for annexed accommodation to be used for holiday and overspill family accommodation</p>	<p>Trehaverne</p>	<p>Scott Jenkins "I understand there is a planning history to this site which potentially still remains relevant. I have not assessed in detail yet, but happy to discuss with you closer to the committee date."</p>	<p>Approval subject to conditions tying the annexe to the main dwelling and restricting use to family members and non-paying guests.</p>
<p>PA18/11692 21 Green Close Mr & Mrs Bunoomally</p>	<p>Proposed first floor rear extension</p>	<p>Redannick</p>	<p>Katie Mosley</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA18/11510 Xenia, Union Street n/a Partum Domus Ltd</p>	<p>Construction of seven dwellings</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Ellis Crompton-Brown "In relation to this application, this is a smaller scheme than was approved in May last year. The previous planning permission was for nine apartments and this application is for seven. I note that your Councils comments in respect of the 9 apartments was for approval. Although I haven't been on site. at this stage, I don't have any significant concerns for this proposal and would look to assess it in the same way as for the previous larger application that was approved by my colleague".</p>	<p>Schedule 2 As the Chairman has declared an interest, the Vice-Chair has made this recommendation.</p>
<p>PA19/00211 Land North Of Little Newham Newham Road Newham Mr Michael Milan</p>	<p>Demolition of detached garage and erection of new dwelling and detached garage</p>	<p>Redannick</p>	<p>Ellis Crompton-Brown "My initial thoughts are that the site is in a sustainable location and would be well integrated in terms of scale, location and character. On the negative side, it is adjacent to a Grade II Listed Building so will need to respect the character and setting of the Listed Building and the views of the Councils Historic Environment team will be sought. The site has a number of trees that may be affected albeit that</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>

Schedule 1

			they are not protected, and I will also be seeking comments from the Councils Tree Officer. In respect of other consultees, I have asked for comments from the Minerals Policy team as it is within the Mineral Safeguarding Area for Newham Heritage Quarry, Environmental Health in respect of Air Quality, the Environment Agency, Cornwall Council Highways and Natural England”.	
PA19/00267 10 Blackberry Way Ms S Ashby	Demolition of conservatory replaced with extension	Tregolls	Janice Taylor	Approval
PA19/00326 Shorton House 7 Kenwyn Gardens Mr Alan Bond	Application for works to multi-stemmed ash tree.	Trehaverne	Janice Taylor “I can confirm that this tree is located within an area Tree Preservation Order. Please continue with this application as an application for works to a tree protected by a Tree Preservation Order”	Schedule 2
PA19/00391 22 Kirby Road Mr John Rowe	Replacement of single storey extension	Trehaverne	Katie Mosley	Approval subject to there being no sustainable objections from the neighbours.
PA19/00354 13 Harrison Terrace Mrs Amanda Davies	Remodelling of an existing extension	Redannick	Janice Taylor “The proposal appears to be rebuilding an existing extension on the same footprint. It would have different fenestration, but the scale would be the same as existing. It is a small, single storey extension to the rear of the main dwelling and as it replaces an extension of a similar scale, it would have minimal impact on the character of the Truro Conservation Area”.	Schedule 2

Schedule 1

<p>PA19/00542 27 Copes Gardens Mr Turner</p>	<p>Works to two sycamore trees</p>	<p>Trehaverne</p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Approval subject to submission of marked up photographs giving a clear indication of the works and acceptance of the works by CC Tree Officer.</p>
<p>PA19/00532 Pencowl 12 Ferris Town Mr James Hore</p>	<p>Listed building consent to attach 5no. standard gas meter boxes to the inside face of the property's boundary wall (adjacent to St Dominic St).</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Jack Bromley "Given that this application replaces the recent approval for 4 gas metre boxes (PA18/09454) and that Historic Environment raise no objection, I have no significant comments to make at this stage. However, I will update you if any issues arise during the process of this application".</p>	<p>Approval subject to the requirements of the Historic Environment service.</p>
<p>PA19/00442 7 Trewinnard Grove Richards</p>	<p>To fell Ash tree</p>	<p>Trehaverne</p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Refusal on the grounds of lack of sufficient information to properly assess the application</p>
<p>PA18/06892 Angel House 1 Infirmary Hill Mr And Mrs Cary</p>	<p>Application to display 3 no external signs</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Sophie Rogers</p>	<p>Approval subject to the requirements of Historic environment officer.</p>

Schedule 2

PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 7 FEBRUARY 2019
SCHEDULE 2 – Applications to be considered at the Meeting.

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Comments from Case Officers	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
(1) PA18/11022 Land Rear of Maiden Green, Threemilestone	Development of a petrol filling station (PFS) including a new sales building, underground tanks, pump island/canopy, forecourt, car parking, landscaping, boundary treatments, drainage infrastructure, associated access arrangements (including A390 junction and associated pedestrian access) and associated infrastructure (including an artificial badger sett).	Kenwyn Parish	Matthew Doble	
(2) PA18/10890 6 Trehaverne Vean Ms A Haynes	Proposed conversion and extension of garage to form one-bedroom self-contained annexe	Trehaverne	Katie Mosley	
(3) PA18/11510 Xenia, Union Street n/a Partum Domus Ltd	Construction of seven dwellings	Boscawen	Ellis Crompton-Brown	
(4) PA18/11692 21 Green Close Mr & Mrs Bunoomally	Proposed first floor rear extension	Redannick	Katie Mosley	
(5) PA18/11956 14 Daniell Street Dr Nicholas Weston Smith	Install shutters to the inside of the front windows: one on the ground floor and two on the first floor. (NB. Listed Building Consent)	Redannick	Janice Taylor	

Schedule 2

(6) PA19/00211 Land North Of Little Newham Newham Road Newham Mr Michael Milan	Demolition of detached garage and erection of new dwelling and detached garage	Redannick	Ellis Crompton-Brown	
(7) PA19/00326 Shorton House 7 Kenwyn Gardens Mr Alan Bond	Application for works to multi-stemmed ash tree.	Trehaverne	Janice Taylor "I can confirm that this tree is located within an area Tree Preservation Order. Please continue with this application as an application for works to a tree protected by a Tree Preservation Order"	
(8) PA19/00354 13 Harrison Terrace Mrs Amanda Davies	Remodelling of an existing extension	Redannick	Janice Taylor	

APPENDIX 3

TRURO CITY COUNCIL

February 2019

To: The Mayor (Councillor Ms. L Southcombe)
The Deputy Mayor (Councillor Smith)
and all members of the **PLANNING COMMITTEE**

PLANNING DECISIONS

I would draw the attention of the Committee to the following Planning Decisions received from Cornwall Council, which **differed from recommendations made by this Committee:**

Application No.	Development & Location	City Council	Cornwall Council
PA18/10301	Extension to dwelling and addition of Garden Room. New access to rear. 70 TREGOLLS ROAD	Unanimous refusal recommended – 7 December 2018 This was on the grounds of inappropriate design and scale. Members invited the applicant to submit a new application with a design that is more appropriate in appearance and a reduction of the scale of the garden room.	Approved with conditions – 16 January 2019 In response to a 5-day householder protocol Truro City Council signalled their wish to take the application to planning committee. Application was approved on conditions set out in the report (as per below) and a site visit was undertaken with the local member for Truro and representatives of the Truro planning committee. It was decided onsite that if the garden room was moved 50cm back away from the rear fence, thus allowing for more foliage to naturally grow up and soften the visual impact. The local member for Truro signalled that they would not wish to take the proposal to full planning committee. Conditions 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission. Reason: In accordance with the requirements of Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004). 2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the plans listed

APPENDIX 3

			<p>below under the heading "Plans Referred to in Consideration of this Application".</p> <p>Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.</p> <p>3. The development hereby permitted shall only be used for purposes incidental to the enjoyment of the dwelling house as such known as 70 Tregolls Road, Truro, Cornwall, TR1 1LD.</p> <p>Reason: In the interests of the residential amenities of the occupiers of neighbouring properties in accordance with paragraph 127 of the National Planning Policy Framework.</p> <p>4 Notwithstanding details shown on any approved plans, surface water run off from the development hereby permitted shall not drain to the sewer, but shall instead be disposed of via an infiltration system in accordance with infiltration guidance in BRE 365 or CIRIA 156 using a 10-year return period design standard, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.</p> <p>Reason: To ensure flood risk is not increased elsewhere in accordance with the aims and intentions of paragraph 163 of the National Planning Policy Framework and Policy 26 of the Cornwall Local Plan</p>
--	--	--	--