

**MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE HELD THURSDAY 7 MARCH 2019  
at 7.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** Councillors Mrs Carlyon, Ellis, Mrs Nolan, Smith, Mrs Swain, Vella  
(Chairman) Webb and Wells.

**APOLOGIES:** Apologies for absence were reported from Councillors Nolan, Ms Southcombe,  
Tamblyn and Mrs Tudor

Also in attendance: Mr Peter Burton, Member of the Electorate

**357 DISCLOSURES OR DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no disclosures or declarations of interest.

**358 MINUTES**

The Minutes of the meeting held 7 February 2019, having been before Council on 25  
February 2018, were signed as a correct record.

**359 PLANNING CONSULTATION**

**(a) Schedule 1**

Further to all Councillors of Truro City Council being given the opportunity to submit  
comments to applications in their Ward (by an agreed deadline), and for Members of  
the Planning Committee to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the  
agenda for this meeting, it was proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) that it be  
unanimously:

**RESOLVED** that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1,  
as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning  
Committee.

**(b) Schedule 2**

The Committee considered plans submitted in accordance with the planning  
consultation procedure, details of which are attached (Schedule 2), and, that it be

**RESOLVED** that Cornwall Council be informed of the following  
recommendations as voted upon by Truro City Council's Planning  
Committee: -

**(i) Lemon Quay, Back Quay (1)**  
(PA19/00255)

Councillor Mrs Carlyon joined the meeting at 7:14pm.

Mr Burton spoke against the application for three minutes, according to procedural  
guidance.

Unanimous refusal recommended on the grounds that the screen would have a  
serious detrimental effect on the Conservation Area, regardless of its temporary  
nature, and on the setting of an important Grade II\* Listed Building.

Members were also concerned about the screen's potential distraction to members of  
the public next to a busy road and felt that any temporary screen would be better  
placed on the temporary huts (which would ensure its removal upon completion of  
the works at the Hall for Cornwall).

The Chairman questioned the validity of the application as the application form lists Truro City Council as the owners of the land (item 10), which is not correct; Truro City Council manages Lemon Quay, but Cornwall Council is the owner.

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(ii) **47 Treworder Road (2)**  
(PA19/00874)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the construction of single-storey rear extension, dormer extension and creation of an additional parking space on the grounds of overdevelopment, an unsympathetic and inappropriate design that would be detrimental to the character of that part of the estate, and the proposal being unneighbourly.

Proposer: Councillor Ellis  
Secunder: Councillor Webb

Mr Burton (member of the public) left the meeting at 7:35pm.

(iii) **Land at Merrick Avenue (3)**  
(PA19/01024)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the works to remove the T1 Sycamore tree covered by a Tree Preservation Order. Members agreed with the Tree Officer's comment that there is no justification for the felling of the tree, and commented the tree makes a significant contribution to the area.

Proposer: Councillor Ellis  
Secunder: Councillor Mrs Carlyon

(iv) **Higher Newham Farm (4)**  
(PA19/01094)

Unanimous refusal for the Reserved Matters application on the grounds of Members' previous comments of strong objections to the scale of the proposal, concern over the sewage and foul water drainage, and issues with the infrastructure and the highway access.

Members agreed that that a new application from the new developer would be preferable as the new scheme was significantly different to the original, which would also change the profile of the population who would reside on the development and therefore the associated required amenities. Members felt that as the new proposal omitted significant elements that the original proposal contained (e.g. community farm etc.), it was an unfair comparison. This was compounded by the developer's comments at the public consultation meetings that this version of the proposal would not be built and existed purely to keep permissions "live".

Proposer: Councillor Wells  
Secunder: Councillor Mrs Carlyon

**360 LANGARTH STAKEHOLDER GROUP**

Further to Minute 315 (07.02.19) of Council, Councillor Smith (Mayor Elect) explained to Members that the first meeting of the Stakeholder Group, which had been formed thanks to Councillor Mrs. Tudor's amendment to a recommendation at Cornwall Council, had mostly been concerned with setting the parameters and remit of the group. Adam Burchill, who attended the meeting, had informed the group that

Cornwall Council was committed to referring to local opinion and the Stakeholder Group's contributions.

Councillor Vella (the Chairman) commented that the next meeting had been deferred from 12 March to 26 March 2019, and he was awaiting confirmation of the time and location.

**361 CHAIRMAN'S REPORT**

Councillor Vella (Chairman) commented he was sad to announce that the Planning Assistant was leaving the City Council. The Chairman praised her work, commenting that she would be very much missed. Interviews for a replacement assistant would take place on Monday 18 March and both the Chairman and the Planning Clerk would be on the interview panel.

**362 CORRESPONDENCE**

**Appeal Decision, Land West of Treglennick, New Mills Lane, Kenwyn, Truro (PA18.03488)**

Councillor Vella (Chairman) commented that a notification of an appeal decision for the above had been received, and unfortunately the appeal was allowed, and planning permission was granted. The Chairman commented that it was unfortunate the Inspector had not considered the appeal decision for White Cottage, as it specifically discussed the issue of not developing into the countryside surrounding Truro.

The meeting closed at 8:03pm.

-----  
CHAIRMAN

# Schedule 1

## PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 7 March 2019

### SCHEDULE 1 – To Receive a Single Recommendation for the Entire Schedule at the Meeting.

*If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Thursday 28 February at 5pm for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.*

*If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.*

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Comments from Case Officers	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
<b>PA19/00907</b> <b>31 Copes Gardens</b> <b>Smith</b>	Removal of deadwood damaged branches from the crown and also a crown lift to 5 metres above ground level.	<b>Trehaverne</b>	Janice Taylor- extension approved	Approval recommended subject to the agreement of CC Tree Officer that crown raising to 5 metres is justified and limited to removal of dead wood only.
<b>PA19/00255</b> <b>Lemon Quay, Back Quay</b> <b>The Clerk, Truro City Council</b>	Advertisement consent for screen to be used for information and local promotion, localism, Cornwall Council communications, paid advertisement slots and screenings of theatre/ballet production	<b>Boscawen</b>	Camellia Bullingham – extension approved “I have concerns over the size and the design of the structure itself and its impact on the setting, this is my initial view and I am currently waiting on consultee responses”	Schedule 2
<b>PA18/11431</b> <b>The Carriage House</b> <b>Infirmery Hill</b> <b>Mr Michael Grundy</b>	Application for tree works to crown reduce a Eucalyptus Tree in a conservation Area.	<b>Boscawen</b>	Janice Taylor – extension approved	Approval recommended subject to the requirements of the Tree Officer.

# Schedule 1

<p><b>PA19/00874</b>  <b>47 Treworder Road</b>  <b>Mr &amp; Mrs Tim Winnan</b></p>	<p>Construction of single-storey rear extension, dormer extension and create an additional parking space</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p><b>PA19/00720</b>  <b>Chy Gwyn Adelaide Terrace</b>  <b>Mr A Dengler</b></p>	<p>Construction of a two storey extension, leanto store, extension of car parking area, and alterations.</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p><b>PA19/01032</b>  <b>2 Merrick Avenue</b>  <b>Mr K Stone</b></p>	<p>Proposed front extensions and associated works</p>	<p><b>Tregolls</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor          “The application is for a small, flat roofed extension to the front of the existing dwelling, it would be a continuation of an existing porch/entrance lobby. The materials/external finishes would match the existing dwelling.</p> <p>The surrounding properties are of a similar character; however, this property appears to have a high hedge which would obscure the proposal from public view. The proposal would not cause additional overlooking or overshadowing and is likely to have a limited impact on the street scene”.</p>	<p>Approval recommended subject to there being no sustainable objections from the neighbours. (Chairman has declared an interest as he knows the applicant and therefore Vice-Chairman is making a recommendation).</p>

# Schedule 1

<p><b>PA19/01085</b>  <b>8 Clifton Gardens</b>  <b>Mr and Mrs Leighton</b>  <b>Simmons</b></p>	<p>Single storey extension to existing dwelling.</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Approval recommended subject to there being no sustainable objections from the neighbours.</p>
<p><b>PA19/00764</b>  <b>22 Epworth Close</b>  <b>Mr and Mrs Drew</b></p>	<p>Demolition of existing rear conservatory and replace with kitchen extension.</p>	<p><b>Tregolls</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p><b>PA19/01024</b>  <b>Land at Merrick Avenue</b>  <b>Mr P Moon</b></p>	<p>Works to remove T1 Sycamore tree covered by a Tree Preservation Order</p>	<p><b>Tregolls</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Refusal recommended due to lack of justification. The tree contributes a great deal to the quality of the local environment and is much appreciated by residents. We note that the applicant's agent's report is at odds with the Tree Officer's assessment of the tree.</p>

# Schedule 1

<p><b>PA19/00661</b>  <b>Half Acre, Barrack Lane</b>  <b>Mr &amp; Mrs David Pollard</b></p>	<p>Proposed bedroom extension, demolition of garage, utility room and store and construction of extension to provide new store, utility room and loggia</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p><b>PA19/01217</b>  <b>7-8 Boscawen Street</b>  <b>Branch Manager, Lloyds Bank</b></p>	<p>Listed Building Consent for the removal of an existing, through wall Wincor 2150 ATM unit which is accessible within the open plan banking hall and installation of new NCR 6627 ATM</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham</p>	<p>Approval subject to the requirements of the Conservation Officer.</p>
<p><b>PA19/01094</b>  <b>Higher Newham Farm</b>  <b>Mr Angus Johnstone,</b>  <b>Places for People Homes</b></p>	<p>Approval of reserved matters for access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale in relation to outline planning permission PA14/07792 APP/Do840/W/15/3030407 for 155 dwellings and associated parking.</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p>Matthew Doble</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p><b>PA19/01235</b>  <b>55 Castle Street</b>  <b>Thompson Fairview Developments Ltd</b></p> <p><b>PA19/01236</b>  <b>(As above)</b></p>	<p>Enlargement of toilet accommodation to form store/retail area, and kitchenette.</p> <p>Listed Building Consent for the above</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham</p>	<p>Approval recommended subject to the requirements of the Conservation Officer.</p>

# Schedule 1

<p><b>PA19/00395</b>  <b>Kathmandu Palace,</b>  <b>1<sup>st</sup> Floor, 19 Old Bridge</b>  <b>Street</b>  <b>Cornwall Council</b></p>	<p>Listed Building Consent for proposed works involved in the reconstruction and maintenance work to a localised section of a retaining wall adjacent to the River Allen in Truro</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p>Sophie Rogers</p>	<p>Approval recommended subject to strict adherence to the requirements of CC's Historic Environment service.</p>
<p><b>PA19/01306</b>  <b>Ground floor, 66 Lemon</b>  <b>Street</b>  <b>Miss Sandhya</b>  <b>Dharumpal Ibuntu Ltd</b></p>	<p>Listed building consent for proposed projecting sign to the outside of the building.</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham</p>	<p>Refusal recommended and ask that they re-submit with more appropriate design and materials.</p>
<p><b>PA19/01690</b>  <b>Calderstone 4 Lodge</b>  <b>Drive</b>  <b>Mr &amp; Mrs Dixon</b></p>	<p>Side extension to existing dwelling and replacement of conservatory</p>	<p><b>Tregolls</b></p>	<p>Janice Taylor</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p><b>PA19/00428</b>  <b>7-9 Second Floor</b>  <b>Right Office Old Bridge</b>  <b>Street</b></p>	<p>Change of use from office space into an a1 retail for use as a beauty salon</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>



# Schedule 2

**PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 7 MARCH 2019**  
**SCHEDULE 2 – Applications to be considered at the Meeting.**

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Comments from Case Officers	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
<b>(1) PA19/00255</b> <b>Lemon Quay, Back Quay</b> <b>The Clerk, Truro City Council</b>	Advertisement consent for screen to be used for information and local promotion, localism, Cornwall Council communications, paid advertisement slots and screenings of theatre/ballet production	<b>Boscawen</b>	Camellia Bullingham – extension approved “I have concerns over the size and the design of the structure itself and its impact on the setting, this is my initial view and I am currently waiting on consultee responses”	
<b>(2) PA19/00874</b> <b>47 Treworder Road</b> <b>Mr &amp; Mrs Tim Winnan</b>	Construction of single-storey rear extension, dormer extension and create an additional parking space	<b>Redannick</b>	Janice Taylor	
<b>(3) PA19/01024</b> <b>Land at Merrick Avenue</b> <b>Mr P Moon</b>	Works to remove T1 Sycamore tree covered by a Tree Preservation Order	<b>Tregolls</b>	Janice Taylor	
<b>(4) PA19/01094</b> <b>Higher Newham Farm</b> <b>Mr Angus Johnstone,</b> <b>Places for People</b> <b>Homes</b>	Approval of reserved matters for access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale in relation to outline planning permission PA14/07792 APP/Do840/W/15/3030407 for 155 dwellings and associated parking.	<b>Redannick</b>	Matthew Doble	