

**MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE HELD THURSDAY 4 JULY 2019
at 7.00 pm**

PRESENT: Councillors Mrs Carlyon, Ellis, Nolan, Ms Southcombe, Smith, Mrs Swain, Vella (Chairman) Webb and Wells.

APOLOGIES: An Apology for absence was reported from Councillor Tamblyn

68 DISCLOSURES OR DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no disclosures or declarations of interest to report.

69 MINUTES

The Minutes of the meeting held 6 June 2019, having been before Council on 24 June 2019, were signed as a correct record.

70 PLANNING CONSULTATION

(a) Schedule 1

Further to all Councillors of Truro City Council being given the opportunity to submit comments to applications in their Ward (by an agreed deadline), and for Members of the Planning Committee to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the agenda for this meeting, it was proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) that it be unanimously:

RESOLVED that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1, as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning Committee.

(b) Schedule 2

The Committee considered plans submitted in accordance with the planning consultation procedure, details of which are attached (Schedule 2), and, that it be

RESOLVED that Cornwall Council be informed of the following recommendations as voted upon by Truro City Council's Planning Committee: -

(i) Hall for Cornwall (1)

(PA19/02820)

Approval recommended for the Listed Building consent for alterations to the previously consented scheme.

Proposer: Councillor Wells

Seconder: Councillor Webb

(ii) 1 King Street (2)

(PA19/03354)

Unanimous refusal recommended for advertisement consent because although the change of colour was welcome, the use of acrylic and vinyl signage is contrary to Policy C5 of the Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Plan. The proposal would have an adverse effect on the setting of the Conservation Area and the Grade I Listed Building (Truro Cathedral).

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(iii) 2 Trennick Row, Malpas Road (3 (i & ii))

(PA19/04128 & PA19/03977)

Refusal recommended for the rebuilding of the garden wall in concrete block and render, as the use of inappropriate materials in the curtilage of a Grade II Listed Building in the Conservation Area is contrary to Policy C3 of the Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Plan. Members suggest the wall is rebuilt in a traditional manner using as much of the original material as possible, supplemented with local stone.

Proposer: Councillor Mrs Carlyon
Seconder: Councillor Ellis

(iv) **Archbishop Benson Church of England Primary School (4)**
(PA19/04389)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the safeguarding works as although Members support the footpath in principle, the proposed works would not solve the issue but would increase danger for pedestrians and drivers and would have an adverse effect on local residents by blocking access to driveways and Moresk Gardens and would seriously delay traffic using the very narrow road. In addition, the fencing is inappropriate for a primary school, being oppressive and industrial in style and out of scale and did not need to be so obtrusive. Members suggested the school liaises with Highways and Truro City Council to reach an alternative, safe solution to pedestrian access from Moresk Road, and commented the "walking bus" could be re-introduced, with a concessionary parking arrangement in the council car parks at the bottom of the hill.

Proposer: Councillor Webb
Seconder: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(v) **7 Dudman Road (5)**
(PA19/04692)

Approval recommended for the removal of the existing conservatory and erection of the replacement extension.

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(vi) **Trevethenick Road (6)**
(PA19/04876)

Refusal recommended for the windows to be replaced with UPVC on the grounds of the materials being inappropriate in the Conservation Area and contrary to Policy C1 of the Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Plan.

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

Councillor Smith (the Mayor) wished for his name to be recorded as having abstained from voting on the above recommendation.

(vii) **Chy Keres, Alverton Lane (7)**
(PA19/04917)

Refusal recommended as the site falls within the blanket Tree Preservation Order of the Tremorvah/Uplands Crescent area and the proposal indicates two trees would be removed. In principle, Members had no issue with the extension, although the style of windows should be in keeping with the existing dwelling and invite the applicant to return with a more suitable design that does not require the removal of protected trees.

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(viii) **Land South of Newmills Lane (8)**
(PA19/05013)

Approval recommended for the advertisement consent subject to the advert's immediate removal once all the houses have been sold.

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(ix) **7 Arundell Place (9)**
(PA19/05225)

Approval recommended for the two-storey extension and internal alterations.

Proposer: Councillor Webb
Seconder: Councillor Ellis

Councillors Nolan and Wells wished for their names to be recorded as having abstained from voting on the above recommendation.

(x) **Land Rear of 20 & 21 Copes Gardens** (10)
(PA19/05243)

Approval recommended for the construction of a new design dormer bungalow subject to there being no sustainable planning objections from the neighbour and that the applicant is mindful of the needs of the neighbour during construction.

Proposer: Councillor Wells
Seconder: Councillor Ellis

Councillor Mrs Carlyon wished for her name to be recorded as having voted against the above recommendation.

(xi) **2-3 Pydar Street** (11 (i & ii))
(PA19/05342 & PA19/05343)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the redecoration of the storefront and blade sign on the grounds the proposal contravenes policy C5 of the Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Plan due to it being out of scale, and the use of unacceptable materials which would have an adverse impact on the Conservation Area and the setting of a Grade I Listed Building (Truro Cathedral).

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

(xii) **2-3 Pydar Street** (12)
(PA19/05357)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the advertisement consent to display two fascia signs and one hanging sign on the grounds the proposal contravenes policy C5 of the Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Plan due to it being out of scale, and the use of unacceptable materials which would have an adverse impact on the Conservation Area and the setting of a Grade I Listed Building (Truro Cathedral).

Proposer: Councillor Vella (Chairman)

71 **CONSULTATIONS**

(i) **“Planning for Coastal Change”**

Councillors considered the “Planning for Coastal Change” consultation (previously circulated via email), the closing date for which was Monday 22 July 2019.

Following further discussion, it was proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) and

RESOLVED that Members submit any comments via email to the Planning Clerk or Chairman by Tuesday 9 July for the Chairman to draft a letter for submission in response to the “Planning for Coastal Change” consultation.

(ii) **“Pydar Street Development”**

At the Town Clerk’s request, Members considered draft plans (previously circulated via email) of the Pydar Street Development. The Committee discussed the need for separation between the different types of accommodation, the importance of consultation with the City Council, and the need for consideration of the distributor road to provide a safe separation between vehicles and pedestrians.

It was therefore proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) and

RESOLVED that the Planning Clerk would ask the architect and a representative of Cornwall Council to attend a Special Meeting of the Council (with the Mayor's permission granted) to explain their current position on the Pydar Street Development.

72 LANGARTH STAKEHOLDER GROUP

Councillor Vella (Chairman) commented that at the last meeting of the Langarth Stakeholder Group, attendees were asked to present three images with captions they felt best represented their aspirations for Langarth. Councillor Vella (Chairman) presented images he hoped expressed a desire for community, preserving the landscaping on site, including areas such as fields and boundaries, as well as facilitating homeworking to avoid the need to commute into the City. Public transport links were also important to discourage the use of cars, although it was acknowledged as the park and ride could not be used as a normal bus service there were currently limitations.

The membership of the Langarth Stakeholder Group was discussed, and Councillor Smith (the Mayor) and Councillor Nolan commented they were no longer invited to meetings. Members wondered about the purpose of the group and whether it existed as a "check box" for consultation on Langarth. Members also felt there was significant crossover as the review of the Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Plan was instigated to consider site allocation for the Langarth development, and there was concern over what would happen should the two groups reach different conclusions.

It was therefore proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) and

RESOLVED that Mrs Dulcie Tudor CC (Chairman of the Langarth Stakeholder Group), Rob Lacey and Rachael Gaunt (who were organising both the Neighbourhood Plan and Langarth Stakeholder Group meetings) be invited to attend a meeting prior to the next meeting of the Planning Committee to give a summary of the current position at Langarth.

73 CHAIRMAN'S REPORT

The Chairman had nothing to report as it had already been covered during the meeting.

74 CORRESPONDENCE

Tree Preservation Order (TPO) – Land Adjacent to Merrick Avenue

The Chairman read out the above TPO Order which stated a TPO had been applied to this area of land with a modified map showing the correct site.

The meeting closed at 8:16pm.

CHAIRMAN

Schedule 1

PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 4 JULY 2019

SCHEDULE 1 – To Receive a Single Recommendation for the Entire Schedule at the Meeting.

If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Thursday 27 June at 5pm for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.

If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Comments from Case Officers	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
PA19/04541 43 Treworder Road Mr and Mrs Pugh	Proposed extension above garage to provide additional bedroom.	Redannick	Camellia Bullingham: I haven't assessed this one yet but will forward on comments when I have	Approval recommended
PA19/04692 7 Dudman Road Mr and Mrs Lance Lannon	Removal of existing conservatory and erection of replacement extension.	Redannick	Camellia Bullingham: I haven't assessed this one yet but will forward on comments when I have	Schedule 2
PA19/04288 3 Dudman Road Mr and Mrs Lance Lannon	Construction of single storey rear extension to existing dwelling.	Redannick	Janice Taylor: The application is for a single storey rear extension to an existing dwelling. There are limited views of the rear of the property, therefore the proposal would have minimal impact on the street scene. The windows face away from the neighbours and would not significantly increase overlooking or overshadowing. I have no major concerns.	Approval recommended subject to no valid planning objection from any neighbour
PA19/04637 4 Higher Trehaverne Mr and Mrs Thurlow	Demolition of existing ground floor extensions and replacement with new ground floor and first floor extensions to rear and extension to garage.	Trehaverne	Niamh Ashworth: Proposed impact on neighbouring properties looks acceptable, given existing extensions on adjoining semi-detached dwellinghouse. Limited impact on character of area due to siting of extensions to the rear. Recommend approval.	Approval recommended subject to no sustainable objection from neighbours.

Schedule 1

<p>PA19/03354 1 King Street Ms Jamie Jones</p>	<p>Advertisement consent for changes to existing fascia signage and replacement of existing projecting sign with a new hanging sign in a different position.</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Niamh Ashworth: They do propose a painted exterior grade plywood sign with black acrylic on the proposed hanging sign and no illumination. I would question whether they can use acrylic lettering or whether we would insist on hand painted finish. Principle acceptable as we approved something very similar in 2015 and can use similar worded conditions.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/02820 Hall for Cornwall Mr Simon Crick</p>	<p>Listed Building Consent for alterations to previously consented scheme for the staircase and upper mezzanine to the Back Quay Building</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Martin Woodley: These works have been discussed with the architect on site and are considered to be a significant improvement over the current scheme in reducing the impact and allowing existing features such as the chimney breast to be better perceived and the historic layout understood.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/04128 2 Trennick Row, Malpas Road Mrs Mary Oram</p> <p>PA19/03977</p>	<p>Rebuilding garden wall in concrete block and lime render</p> <p>Listed Building Consent for the above</p>	<p>Tregolls</p>	<p>Claire Broughton: I haven't properly considered the application as yet, but I've received comments from the Conservation Officer who states that the proposed works are considered acceptable, and has no further comments.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p> <p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/04241 81 Tinney Drive Mr Michael Pickering</p>	<p>Proposed work to trim a large Willow tree down to fence height, tree hangs over a public footpath and two garden fences.</p>	<p>Tregolls</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham: As this is a tree application I am awaiting a consultee response from the tree officer who will inform the decision.</p>	<p>Refusal recommended due to a lack of justification, with an invitation to resubmit with a much less drastic proposal that limits the extent of work to an acceptable amount.</p>

Schedule 1

<p>PA19/04876 Trevethenick Road Mr Shwalbe Livewest C/O Wrekin Windows</p>	<p>Existing timber windows to be replaced with PVC (like for like) to Nos 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12, 17, 18, 19, 20 and 21</p>	<p>Tregolls</p>	<p>Niamh Ashworth: Site Visit today 25th June. Current windows on those properties to have replacement windows are brown timber, to be replaced with white UPVC. There are a mixture of both type of windows in the estate. Several properties to the south and east of the site already have white UPVC. Those flats / dwellings to the north and east still have brown timber windows. Given that the dwellings are within the estate and not fronting the main through road to Malpus, I do not think they cause significant detrimental harm to the character of the area. They help to preserve the conservation area. Recommend approval.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/04917 Chy Keres, Alverton Road Mr and Mrs Patwardham</p>	<p>Proposed replacement of existing garage with a two-storey extension to the front and improvement to entrance together with lean-to extension to rear with associated landscaping to replace garage with parking</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Niamh Ashworth: Principle of development and proposed design of dwellinghouse appears acceptable. Awaiting further information on trees and outbuildings.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/05225 7 Arundell Place Mr and Mrs Jason and Lynn Martin</p>	<p>Two storey extension and internal alterations to the rear forming a new kitchen space at ground floor and a new bedroom, dressing room and en-suite at first floor. Single storey extension to the side forming a new utility room</p>	<p>Redannick</p>	<p>Janice Taylor: The scheme is for a two storey rear extension and a single storey extension linking the main dwelling to the detached garage. The proposed extension would have limited impact on the street scene and would not adversely impact on the residential amenities of the neighbours.</p> <p>I note that there are some mature trees in close proximity to the site and have requested further advice from our Tree Officers.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>

Schedule 1

<p>PA19/04389 Archbishop Benson Church of England Primary School Mr Alex Smith, Archbishop of Benson Primary School</p>	<p>Safeguarding works including installation of fencing and gates as well as creating a new pedestrian access route to the site through the existing site boundary.</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham:</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/05243 Land Rear of 20 & 21 Copes Gardens Mr & Mrs Tristan Thomas</p>	<p>Construction of new design dormer bungalow on plot. Part retrospective.</p>	<p>Trehaverne</p>	<p>Janice Taylor: The plot has planning permission for a residential unit; the proposal seeks to amend the approved design. The proposed dwelling would be single storey to match the surrounding properties. It would be clad in vertical cedar boarding. The windows would face away from the neighbouring properties and the height would not of the proposal would not significantly exceed the height of the neighbour's fence. The proposal would not appear dominant within the street scene.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/05357 2-3 Pydar Street Mr David Wright, Procook</p>	<p>Advertisement Consent to display two fascia signs and one hanging sign</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham:</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/05013 Land South of Newmills Lane Mrs Jo Harley Gilbert and Goode</p>	<p>Advertisement consent for 1no. free standing marketing sign for new housing development</p>	<p>Trehaverne</p>	<p>Martin Woodley: I do not see a problem with such temporary signage connected to the development.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/05342 2-3 Pydar Street Mr David Wright PROCOOK</p>	<p>Redecoration of existing timber storefront only and redecoration of existing blade sign. Colour is now mid grey. New matt self applied Fascia logo and self applied logo to both sides of existing blade sign.</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham:</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>PA19/05343</p>	<p>Listed Building Consent for the above.</p>			<p>Schedule 2</p>

Schedule 2

PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 4 JULY 2019
SCHEDULE 2 – Applications to be considered at the Meeting.

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Comments from Case Officers	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
(1) PA19/02820 Mr Simon Crick Hall for Cornwall	Listed Building Consent for alterations to previously consented scheme for the staircase and upper mezzanine to the Back Quay Building	Boscawen	Martin Woodley: These works have been discussed with the architect on site and are considered to be a significant improvement over the current scheme in reducing the impact and allowing existing features such as the chimney breast to be better perceived and the historic layout understood.	Approval recommended
(2) PA19/03354 1 King Street Ms Jamie Jones	Advertisement consent for changes to existing fascia signage and replacement of existing projecting sign with a new hanging sign in a different position	Boscawen	Niamh Ashworth: They do propose a painted exterior grade plywood sign with black acrylic on the proposed hanging sign and no illumination. I would question whether they can use acrylic lettering or whether we would insist on hand painted finish. Principle acceptable as we approved something very similar in 2015 and can use similar worded conditions.	Unanimous refusal recommended
(3) PA19/04128 2 Trennick Row, Malpas Road Mrs Mary Oram PA19/03977	Rebuilding garden wall in concrete block and lime render Listed Building Consent for the above	Tregolls	Claire Broughton: I haven't properly considered the application as yet, but I've received comments from the Conservation Officer who states that the proposed works are considered acceptable, and has no further comments.	Refusal recommended

Schedule 2

<p>(4) PA19/04389 Archbishop Benson Church of England Primary School Mr Alex Smith, Archbishop Benson C of E Primary School</p>	<p>Safeguarding works including installation of fencing and gates as well as creating a new pedestrian access route to the site through the existing site boundary.</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham:</p>	<p>Unanimous refusal recommended</p>
<p>(5) PA19/04692 7 Dudman Road Mr and Mrs Lannon</p>	<p>Removal of existing conservatory and erection of replacement extension</p>	<p>Redannick</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham: I haven't assessed this one yet but will forward on comments when I have</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p>(6) PA19/04876 Trevethenick Road Mr Shwalbe Live West C/O Wrekin Windows</p>	<p>Existing timber windows to be replaced with PVC (like for like) to Nos 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12, 17, 18, 19, 20 and 21</p>	<p>Tregolls</p>	<p>Niamh Ashworth: Site Visit today 25th June. Current windows on those properties to have replacement windows are brown timber, to be replaced with white UPVC. There are a mixture of both type of windows in the estate. Several properties to the south and east of the site already have white UPVC. Those flats / dwellings to the north and east still have brown timber windows. Given that the dwellings are within the estate and not fronting the main through road to Malpus, I do not think they cause significant detrimental harm to the character of the area. They help to preserve the conservation area. Recommend approval.</p>	<p>Refusal recommended</p>
<p>(7) PA19/04917 Chy Keres, Alverton Lane Mr and Mrs Patwardham</p>	<p>Proposed replacement of existing garage with a two-storey extension to the front and improvement to entrance together with a lean-to extension to rear with associated landscaping to replace garage with parking.</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Niamh Ashworth: Principle of development and proposed design of dwellinghouse appears acceptable. Awaiting further information on trees and outbuildings.</p>	<p>Refusal recommended</p>

Schedule 2

<p>(8) PA19/05013 Land South of Newmills Lane Mrs Jo Harley Gilbert and Goode</p>	<p>Advertisement consent for 1no. free standing marketing sign for new housing development.</p>	<p>Trehaverne</p>	<p>Martin Woodley: I do not see a problem with such temporary signage connected to the development.</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p>(9) PA19/05225 7 Arundell Place Mr and Mrs Jason and Lynn Martin</p>	<p>Two storey extension and internal alterations to the rear forming a new kitchen space at ground floor and a new bedroom, dressing room and en-suite at first floor. Single storey extension to the side forming a new utility room</p>	<p>Redannick</p>	<p>Janice Taylor: The scheme is for a two storey rear extension and a single storey extension linking the main dwelling to the detached garage. The proposed extension would have limited impact on the street scene and would not adversely impact on the residential amenities of the neighbours.</p> <p>I note that there are some mature trees in close proximity to the site and have requested further advice from our Tree Officers.</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p>(10) PA19/05243 Land Rear of 20 & 21 Copes Gardens Mr & Mrs Tristan Thomas</p>	<p>Construction of new design dormer bungalow on plot. Part retrospective.</p>	<p>Trehaverne</p>	<p>Janice Taylor: The plot has planning permission for a residential unit; the proposal seeks to amend the approved design. The proposed dwelling would be single storey to match the surrounding properties. It would be clad in vertical cedar boarding. The windows would face away from the neighbouring properties and the height would not of the proposal would not significantly exceed the height of the neighbour's fence. The proposal would not appear dominant within the street scene.</p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>

Schedule 2

<p>(11) PA19/05342 2-3 Pydar Street Mr David Wright, PROCOOK</p> <p>PA19/05343</p>	<p>Redecoration of existing timber storefront only and redecoration of existing blade sign. Colour is now mid grey. New matt self applied Fascia logo and self applied logo to both sides of existing blade sign.</p> <p>Listed Building Consent for the above.</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham:</p>	<p>Unanimous refusal recommended</p>
<p>(12) PA19/05357 2-3 Pydar Street Mr David Wright, PROCOOK</p>	<p>Advertisement Consent to display two fascia signs and one hanging sign</p>	<p>Boscawen</p>	<p>Camellia Bullingham:</p>	<p>Unanimous refusal recommended</p>